arXiv:math/0305087v1 [math.NT] 6 May 2003

The inverse problem for representation functions of additive bases*

Melvyn B. Nathanson†
Department of Mathematics
Lehman College (CUNY)
Bronx, New York 10468
Email: nathansn@alpha.lehman.cuny.edu

February 1, 2008

Abstract

Let A be a set of integers. For every integer n, let $r_{A,2}(n)$ denote the number of representations of n in the form $n = a_1 + a_2$, where $a_1, a_2 \in A$ and $a_1 \leq a_2$. The function $r_{A,2} : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\}$ is the *representation function of order* 2 *for* A. The set A is called an *asymptotic basis of order* 2 if $r_{A,2}^{-1}(0)$ is finite, that is, if every integer with at most a finite number of exceptions can be represented as the sum of two not necessarily distinct elements of A. It is proved that every function is a representation function, that is, if $f : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\}$ is any function such that $f^{-1}(0)$ is finite, then there exists a set A of integers such that $f(n) = r_{A,2}(n)$ for all $n \in \mathbf{Z}$. Moreover, the set A can be constructed so that $\text{card}\{a \in A : |a| \leq x\} \gg x^{1/3}$.

1 Representation functions

Let $\mathbf{N}$, $\mathbf{N}_0$, and $\mathbf{Z}$ denote the positive integers, nonnegative integers, and integers, respectively. Let A and B be sets of integers. We define the *sumset*

$$A + B = \{a + b : a \in A \text{ and } b \in B\},$$

and, in particular,

$$2A = A + A = \{a_1 + a_2 : a_1, a_2 \in A\}$$

*2000 Mathematics Subject Classification: 11B13, 11B34, 11B05. Key words and phrases. Additive bases, sumsets, representation functions, density, Erdős-Turán conjecture, Sidon set.

†This work was supported in part by grants from the NSA Mathematical Sciences Program and the PSC-CUNY Research Award Program.

and

$$A + b = A + \{b\} = \{a + b : a \in A\}.$$

The *restricted sumsets* are

$$A \hat{+} B = \{a + b : a \in A,\ b \in B, \text{ and } a \neq b\}$$

and

$$2 \wedge A = A \hat{+} A = \{a_1 + a_2 : a_1, a_2 \in A \text{ and } a_1 \neq a_2\}.$$

Similarly, we define the *difference set*

$$A - B = \{a - b : a \in A \text{ and } b \in B\}$$

and

$$-A = \{0\} - A = \{-a : -a \in A\}.$$

We introduce the *counting function*

$$A(y, x) = \sum_{\substack{a \in A \\ y \leq a \leq x}} 1.$$

Thus, $A(-x, x)$ counts the number of elements $a \in A$ such that $|a| \leq x$.

For functions f and g, we write $f \gg g$ if there exist numbers c_0 and x_0 such that $|f(x)| \geq c_0|g(x)|$ for all $x \geq x_0$, and $f \ll g$ if $|f(x)| \leq c_0|g(x)|$ for all $x \geq x_0$.

In this paper we study representation functions of sets of integers. For any set $A \subseteq \mathbf{Z}$, the *representation function* $r_{A,2}(n)$ counts the number of ways to write n in the form $n = a_1 + a_2$, where $a_1, a_2 \in A$ and $a_1 \leq a_2$. The set A is called an *asymptotic basis of order 2* if all but finitely many integers can be represented as the sum of two not necessarily distinct elements of A, or, equivalently, if the function

$$r_{A,2} : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\}$$

satisfies

$$\operatorname{card}(r_{A,2}^{-1}(0)) < \infty.$$

Similarly, the *restricted representation function* $\hat{r}_{A,2}(n)$ counts the number of ways to write n in the form $n = a_1 + a_2$, where $a_1, a_2 \in A$ and $a_1 < a_2$. The set A is called a *restricted asymptotic basis of order 2* if all but finitely many integers can be represented as the sum of two distinct elements of A.

Let

$$f : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\} \tag{1}$$

be any function such that

$$\operatorname{card}(f^{-1}(0)) < \infty. \tag{2}$$

The *inverse problem for representation functions of order* 2 is to find sets A such that $r_{A,2}(n) = f(n)$ for all $n \in \mathbf{Z}$. Nathanson [4] proved that every function f

satisfying (1) and (2) is the representation function of an asymptotic basis of order 2, and that such bases A can be arbitrarily *thin* in the sense that the counting functions $A(-x, x)$ tend arbitrarily slowly to infinity. It remained an open problem to construct *thick* asymptotic bases of order 2 for the integers with a prescribed representation function.

In the special case of the function $f(n) = 1$ for all integers n, Nathanson [6] constructed a unique representation basis, that is, a set A of integers with $r_{A,2}(n) = 1$ for all $n \in \mathbf{Z}$, with the additional property that $A(-x, x) \gg \log x$. He posed the problem of constructing a unique representation basis A such that $A(-x, x) \gg x^{\alpha}$ for some $\alpha > 0$.

In this paper we prove that for *every* function f satisfying (1) and (2) there exist uncountably many asymptotic bases A of order 2 such that $r_{A,2}(n) = f(n)$ for all $n \in \mathbf{Z}$, and $A(-x, x) \gg x^{1/3}$. It is not known if there exists a real number $\delta > 0$ such that one can solve the inverse problem for arbitrary functions f satisfying (1) and (2) with $A(-x, x) \gg x^{1/3+\delta}$.

2 The Erdős-Turán conjecture

The set A of nonnegative integers is an asymptotic basis of order 2 for $\mathbf{N}_0$ if the sumset $2A$ contains all sufficently large integers. If A is a set of nonnegative integers, then

$$0 \leq r_{A,2}(n) < \infty$$

for every $n \in \mathbf{N}_0$. It is not true, however, that if

$$f : \mathbf{N}_0 \to \mathbf{N}_0$$

is a function with

$$\text{card}\left(f^{-1}(0)\right) < \infty,$$

then there must exist a set A of nonnegative integers such that $r_{A,2}(n) = f(n)$ for all $n \in \mathbf{N}_0$. For example, Dirac [1] proved that the representation function of an asymptotic basis of order 2 cannot be eventually constant, and Erdős and Fuchs [3] proved that the mean value $\sum_{n \leq x} r_{A,2}(n)$ of an asymptotic basis of order 2 cannot converge too rapidly to cx for any $c > 0$. A famous conjecture of Erdős and Turán [2] states that the representation function of an asymptotic basis of order 2 must be unbounded. This problem is only a special case of the general *inverse problem for representation functions for bases for the nonnegative integers*: Find necessary and sufficient conditions for a function $f : \mathbf{N}_0 \to \mathbf{N}_0$ satisfying $\text{card}\left(f^{-1}(0)\right) < \infty$ to be the representation function of an asymptotic basis of order 2 for $\mathbf{N}_0$.

It is a remarkable recent discovery that the inverse problem for representation functions for the integers, and, more generally, for arbitrary countably infinite abelian groups and countably infinite abelian semigroups with a group component, is significantly easier than the inverse problem for representation functions for the nonnegative integers and for other countably infinite abelian semigroups (Nathanson [5]).

3 Construction of thick bases for the integers

Let $[x]$ denote the integer part of the real number x.

Lemma 1 *Let $f : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\}$ be a function such that $f^{-1}(0)$ is finite. Let Δ denote the cardinality of the set $f^{-1}(0)$. Then there exists a sequence $U = \{u_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$ of integers such that, for every $n \in \mathbf{Z}$ and $k \in \mathbf{N}$,*

$$f(n) = \text{card}\{k \geq 1 : u_k = n\}$$

and

$$|u_k| \leq \left[\frac{k+\Delta}{2}\right].$$

Proof. Every positive integer m can be written uniquely in the form

$$m = s^2 + s + 1 + r,$$

where s is a nonnegative integer and $|r| \leq s$. We construct the sequence

$$\begin{aligned} V &= \{0, -1, 0, 1, -2, -1, 0, 1, 2, -3, -2, -1, 0, 1, 2, 3, \ldots\} \\ &= \{v_m\}_{m=1}^{\infty}, \end{aligned}$$

where

$$v_{s^2+s+1+r} = r \qquad \text{for } |r| \leq s.$$

For every nonnegative integer k, the first occurrence of $-k$ in this sequence is $v_{k^2+1} = -k$, and the first occurrence of k in this sequence is $v_{(k+1)^2} = k$.

The sequence U will be the unique subsequence of V constructed as follows. Let $n \in \mathbf{Z}$. If $f(n) = \infty$, then U will contain the terms $v_{s^2+s+1+n}$ for every $s \geq |n|$. If $f(n) = \ell < \infty$, then U will contain the ℓ terms $v_{s^2+s+1+n}$ for $s = |n|, |n|+1, \ldots, |n|+\ell-1$ in the subsequence U, but not the terms $v_{s^2+s+1+n}$ for $s \geq |n| + \ell$. Let $m_1 < m_2 < m_3 < \cdots$ be the strictly increasing sequence of positive integers such that $\{v_{m_k}\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$ is the resulting subsequence of V. Let $U = \{u_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$, where $u_k = v_{m_k}$. Then

$$f(n) = \text{card}\{k \geq 1 : u_k = n\}.$$

Let $\text{card}\left(f^{-1}(0)\right) = \Delta$. The sequence U also has the following property: If $|u_k| = n$, then for every integer $m \notin f^{-1}(0)$ with $|m| < n$ there is a positive integer $j < k$ with $u_j = m$. It follows that

$$\{0, 1, -1, 2, -2, \ldots, n-1, -(n-1)\} \setminus f^{-1}(0) \subseteq \{u_1, u_2, \ldots, u_{k-1}\},$$

and so

$$k - 1 \geq 2(n-1) + 1 - \Delta.$$

This implies that

$$|u_k| = n \leq \frac{k+\Delta}{2}.$$

Since u_k is an integer, we have

$$|u_k| \leq \left\lfloor \frac{k+\Delta}{2} \right\rfloor.$$

This completes the proof. □

Lemma 1 is best possible in the sense that for every nonnegative integer Δ there is a function $f : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\}$ with $\text{card}\left(f^{-1}(0)\right) = \Delta$ and a sequence $U = \{u_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$ of integers such that

$$|u_k| = \left\lfloor \frac{k+\Delta}{2} \right\rfloor \qquad \text{for all } k \geq 1. \tag{3}$$

For example, if $\Delta = 2\delta + 1$ is odd, define the function f by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } |n| \leq \delta \\ 1 & \text{if } |n| \geq \delta + 1 \end{cases}$$

and the sequence U by

$$\begin{aligned} u_{2i-1} &= \delta + i, \\ u_{2i} &= -(\delta + i) \end{aligned}$$

for all $i \geq 1$.

If $\Delta = 2\delta$ is even, define f by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } -\delta \leq n \leq \delta - 1 \\ 1 & \text{if } n \geq \delta \text{ or } n \leq -\delta - 1 \end{cases}$$

and the sequence U by $u_1 = \delta$ and

$$\begin{aligned} u_{2i} &= \delta + i, \\ u_{2i+1} &= -(\delta + i) \end{aligned}$$

for all $i \geq 1$. In both cases the sequence U satisfies (3).

Theorem 1 *Let $f : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\}$ be any function such that*

$$\Delta = \text{card}(f^{-1}(0)) < \infty.$$

Let

$$c = 8 + \left\lfloor \frac{\Delta + 1}{2} \right\rfloor.$$

There exist uncountably many sets A of integers such that

$$r_{A,2}(n) = f(n) \qquad \textit{for all } n \in \mathbf{Z}$$

and

$$A(-x, x) \geq \left(\frac{x}{c}\right)^{1/3}.$$

Proof. Let

$$\Delta = \mathrm{card}(f^{-1}(0)).$$

By Lemma 1, there exists a sequence $U = \{u_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$ of integers such that

$$f(n) = \mathrm{card}(\{i \in \mathbf{N} : u_i = n\}) \qquad \text{for all integers } n \tag{4}$$

and

$$|u_k| \leq \frac{k+\Delta}{2} \qquad \text{for all } k \geq 1. \tag{5}$$

We shall construct a strictly increasing sequence $\{i_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$ of positive integers and an increasing sequence $\{A_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$ of finite sets of integers such that, for all positive integers k,

(i)
$$|A_k| = 2k,$$

(ii) There exists a positive number c such that
$$A_k \subseteq [-ck^3, ck^3]$$

(iii)
$$r_{A_k,2}(n) \leq f(n) \qquad \text{for all } n \in \mathbf{Z},$$

(iv) For $j = 1, \ldots, k$,
$$r_{A_k,2}(u_j) \geq \mathrm{card}(\{i \leq i_k : u_i = u_j\}).$$

Let $\{A_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$ be a sequence of finite sets satisfying (i)–(iv). We form the infinite set

$$A = \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} A_k.$$

Let $x \geq 8c$, and let k be the unique positive integer such that

$$ck^3 \leq x < c(k+1)^3.$$

Conditions (i) and (ii) imply that

$$A(-x,x) \geq |A_k| = 2k > 2\left(\frac{x}{c}\right)^{1/3} - 2 \geq \left(\frac{x}{c}\right)^{1/3}.$$

Since

$$f(n) = \lim_{k\to\infty} \mathrm{card}(\{i \leq i_k : u_i = n\}),$$

conditions (iii) and (iv) imply that

$$r_{A,2}(n) = \lim_{k\to\infty} r_{A_k,2}(n) = f(n)$$

for all $n \in \mathbf{Z}$.

We construct the sequence $\{A_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$ as follows. Let $i_1 = 1$. The set A_1 will be of the form $A_1 = \{a_1 + u_{i_1}, -a_1\}$, where the integer a_1 is chosen so that $2A_1 \cap f^{-1}(0) = \emptyset$ and $a_1 + u_{i_1} \neq -a_1$. This is equivalent to requiring that

$$2a_1 \notin (f^{-1}(0) - 2u_{i_1}) \cup (-f^{-1}(0)) \cup \{-u_{i_1}\}. \tag{6}$$

This condition excludes at most $1 + 2\Delta$ integers, and so we have at least two choices for the number a_1 such that $|a_1| \leq 1 + \Delta$ and a_1 satisfies (6). Since $|u_{i_1}| = |u_1| \leq (1 + \Delta)/2$ and

$$|a_1 + u_{i_1}| \leq |a_1| + |u_{i_1}| \leq \frac{3(1 + \Delta)}{2},$$

it follows that $A_1 \subseteq [-c, c]$ for any $c \geq 3(1 + \Delta)/2$, and the set A_1 satisfies conditions (i)–(iv).

Let $k \geq 2$ and suppose that we have constructed sets $A_1, \ldots, A_{k-1}$ and integers $i_1 < \cdots < i_{k-1}$ that satisfy conditions (i)–(iv). Let $i_k > i_{k-1}$ be the least integer such that

$$r_{A_{k-1},2}(u_{i_k}) < f(u_{i_k}).$$

Since

$$\begin{aligned} i_k - 1 &\leq \sum_{n \in \{u_1, u_2, \ldots, u_{i_k - 1}\}} r_{A_{k-1},2}(n) \\ &\leq \sum_{n \in \mathbf{Z}} r_{A_{k-1},2}(n) \\ &= \binom{2k-1}{2} \\ &< 2k^2, \end{aligned}$$

it follows that

$$i_k \leq 2k^2.$$

Also, (5) implies that

$$|u_{i_k}| \leq \frac{i_k + \Delta}{2} \leq k^2 + \frac{\Delta}{2}. \tag{7}$$

We want to choose an integer a_k such that the set

$$A_k = A_{k-1} \cup \{a_k + u_{i_k}, -a_k\}$$

satisfies (i)–(iv). We have $|A_k| = 2k$ if

$$a_k + u_{i_k} \neq -a_k$$

and

$$A_{k-1} \cap \{a_k + u_{i_k}, -a_k\} = \emptyset,$$

or, equivalently, if

$$a_k \notin (-A_{k-1}) \cup (A_{k-1} - u_{i_k}) \cup \{-u_{i_k}/2\}. \tag{8}$$

Thus, in order for $A_{k-1} \cup \{a_k + u_{i_k}, -a_k\}$ to satisfy condition (i), we exclude at most $2|A_{k-1}| + 1 = 4k - 3$ integers as possible choices for a_k.

The set A_k will satisfy conditions (iii) and (iv) if

$$2A_k \cap f^{-1}(0) = \emptyset$$

and

$$r_{A_k,2}(n) = \begin{cases} r_{A_{k-1},2}(n) & \text{for all } n \in 2A_{k-1} \setminus \{u_{i_k}\} \\ r_{A_{k-1},2}(n) + 1 & \text{for } n = u_{i_k} \\ 1 & \text{for all } n \in 2A_k \setminus (2A_{k-1} \cup \{u_{i_k}\}). \end{cases}$$

Since the sumset $2A_k$ decomposes into

$$\begin{aligned} 2A_k &= 2\left(A_{k-1} \cup \{a_k + u_{i_k}, -a_k\}\right) \\ &= 2A_{k-1} \cup (A_{k-1} + \{a_k + u_{i_k}, -a_k\}) \cup \{u_{i_k}, 2a_k + 2u_{i_k}, -2a_k\}, \end{aligned}$$

it suffices that

$$(A_{k-1} + \{a_k + u_{i_k}, -a_k\}) \cap 2A_{k-1} = \emptyset, \tag{9}$$

$$(A_{k-1} + \{a_k + u_{i_k}, -a_k\}) \cap f^{-1}(0) = \emptyset, \tag{10}$$

$$(A_{k-1} + a_k + u_{i_k}) \cap (A_{k-1} - a_k) = \emptyset, \tag{11}$$

$$\{2a_k + 2u_{i_k}, -2a_k\} \cap 2A_{k-1} = \emptyset \tag{12}$$

$$\{2a_k + 2u_{i_k}, -2a_k\} \cap f^{-1}(0) = \emptyset \tag{13}$$

$$\{2a_k + 2u_{i_k}, -2a_k\} \cap (A_{k-1} + \{a_k + u_{i_k}, -a_k\}) = \emptyset. \tag{14}$$

Equation (9) implies that the integer a_k must be chosen so that it cannot be represented either in the form

$$a_k = x_1 + x_2 - x_3 - u_{i_k}$$

or

$$a_k = x_1 - x_2 - x_3,$$

where $x_1, x_2, x_3 \in A_{k-1}$. Since $\text{card}(A_{k-1}) = 2(k-1)$, it follows that the number of integers that cannot be chosen as the integer a_k because of equation (9) is at most $2(2(k-1))^3 = 16(k-1)^3$.

Similarly, the numbers of integers excluded as possible choices for a_k because of equations (10), (11), (12), (13), and (14) are at most $4\Delta(k-1), 4(k-1)^2, 8(k-1)^2, 2\Delta$, and $8(k-1)$, respectively, and so the number of integers that cannot be chosen as a_k is

$$\begin{aligned} &16(k-1)^3 + 12(k-1)^2 + (4\Delta + 8)(k-1) + 2\Delta \\ &\quad = 16k^3 - 36k^2 + (32 + 4\Delta)k - 2\Delta - 12 \\ &\quad \le (16 + \Delta)k^3 - 4k^2 - 32k(k-1) - 2\Delta - 12. \end{aligned}$$

Let

$$c = 8 + \left\lceil \frac{\Delta + 1}{2} \right\rceil.$$

The number of integers a with

$$|a| \leq ck^3 - k^2 - \left\lceil \frac{\Delta + 1}{2} \right\rceil = \left(8 + \left\lceil \frac{\Delta + 1}{2} \right\rceil \right) k^3 - k^2 - \left\lceil \frac{\Delta + 1}{2} \right\rceil \tag{15}$$

is

$$\left(16 + 2 \left\lceil \frac{\Delta + 1}{2} \right\rceil \right) k^3 - 2k^2 - 2 \left\lceil \frac{\Delta + 1}{2} \right\rceil + 1$$
$$\geq (16 + \Delta) k^3 - 2k^2 - \Delta.$$

If the integer a satisfies (15), then (7) implies that

$$|a + u_{i_k}| \leq |a| + |u_{i_k}| \leq ck^3.$$

It follows that there are at least two acceptable choices of the integer a_k such that the set $A_k = A_{k-1} \cup \{a_k + u_{i_k}, -a_k\}$ satisfies conditions (i)–(iv). Since this is true at each step of the induction, there are uncountably many sequences $\{A_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$ that satisfy conditions (i)–(iv). This completes the proof. □

We can modify the proof of Theorem 1 to obtain the analogous result for the restricted representation function $\hat{r}_{A,2}(n)$.

Theorem 2 *Let $f : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\}$ be any function such that*

$$\text{card}(f^{-1}(0)) < \infty.$$

Then there exist uncountably many sets A of integers such that

$$\hat{r}_{A,2}(n) = f(n) \qquad \text{for all } n \in \mathbf{Z}$$

and

$$A(-x, x) \gg x^{1/3}.$$

4 Representation functions for bases of order h

We can also prove similar results for the representation functions of asymptotic bases and restricted asymptotic bases of order h for all $h \geq 2$.

For any set $A \subseteq \mathbf{Z}$, the *representation function* $r_{A,h}(n)$ counts the number of ways to write n in the form $n = a_1 + a_2 + \cdots + a_h$, where $a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_h \in A$ and $a_1 \leq a_2 \leq \cdots \leq a_h$. The set A is called an *asymptotic basis of order h* if all but finitely many integers can be represented as the sum of h not necessarily distinct elements of A, or, equivalently, if the function

$$r_{A,h} : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\}$$

satisfies

$$\mathrm{card}(r_{A,h}^{-1}(0)) < \infty.$$

Similarly, the *restricted representation function* $\hat{r}_{A,h}(n)$ counts the number of ways to write n as a sum of h pairwise distinct elements of A. The set A is called a *restricted asymptotic basis of order* h if all but finitely many integers can be represented as the sum of h pairwise distinct elements of A.

Theorem 3 *Let $f : \mathbf{Z} \to \mathbf{N}_0 \cup \{\infty\}$ be any function such that*

$$\mathrm{card}(f^{-1}(0)) < \infty.$$

There exist uncountably many sets A of integers such that

$$r_{A,h}(n) = f(n) \qquad \text{for all } n \in \mathbf{Z}$$

and

$$A(-x, x) \gg x^{1/(2h-1)},$$

and there exist uncountably many sets A of integers such that

$$\hat{r}_{A,h}(n) = f(n) \qquad \text{for all } n \in \mathbf{Z}$$

and

$$A(-x, x) \gg x^{1/(2h-1)}.$$

References

[1] G. A. Dirac, *Note on a problem in additive number theory*, J. London Math. Soc. **26** (1951), 312–313.

[2] P. Erdős and P. Turán, *On a problem of Sidon in additive number theory and some related questions*, J. London Math. Soc. **16** (1941), 212–215.

[3] P. Erdős and W. H. J. Fuchs, *On a problem of additive number theory*, J. London Math. Soc. **31** (1956), 67–73.

[4] M. B. Nathanson, *Every function is the representation function of an additive basis for the integers*, www.arXiv.org, math.NT/0302091.

[5] ———, *Representation functions of additive bases for abelian semigroups*, Ramanujan J., to appear.

[6] ———, *Unique representation bases for the integers*, Acta Arith., to appear.